Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

Message Text

SECRET

PAGE 01 NATO 06816 141704Z
ACTION ACDA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 ACDE-00 SSO-00 INRE-00
USIE-00 ERDA-05 CIAE-00 H-01 INR-07 IO-13 L-03
NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-04 PRS-01 SP-02
SS-15 TRSE-00 NSC-05 NSCE-00 ERDE-00 /083 W
----------054222 141710Z /47
O 141651Z JUL 77
FM USMISSION NATO
TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 4859
SECDEF WASHDC IMMEDIATE
INFO AMEMBASSY BONN
AMEMBASSY LONDON
USDEL MBFR VIENNA
USNMR SHAPE BE
USCINCEUR VAIHINGEN GER

S E C R E T NATO 06816

E.O.11652: GDS
TAGS: PARM, NATO
SUBJECT: MBFR: RED DATA: SPC MEETING JULY 14

REF: NATO 6689 (DTG 112139Z JUL 77)

1. AT JULY 14 SPC MEETING, FRG REP (CITRON) NOTED THAT AT THE PREVIOUS MEETING HE HAD AGREED ON A PERSONAL BASIS WITH THE ITALIAN PROPOSAL THAT SPC RESUME DISCUSSION SOON ON THE TABLING OF WESTERN ESTIMATES OF EASTERN DATA, I.E., "RED DATA" (PARA 6, REFTEL). FRG REP SAID HE NOW HAD INSTRUCTIONS ON THIS ISSUE. FRG BELIEVES THAT THE AHG SHOULD BE PROVIDED RED DATA BROKEN DOWN IN A SIMILAR WAY TO THE DATA ANNEXES ON WESTERN DATA IN ORDER TO GIVE THE AHG THE POSSIBILITY OF PREPARING ITSELF IN CASE THE EAST ACCEPTS THE WESTERN FRAMEWORK PROPOSAL FOR A DATA DISCUSSION. THE FRG BELIEVES THAT THE AHG SHOULD BE AUTHORIZED TO USE RED DATA IN INDIVIDUAL CASES WHERE EASTERN DATA NEEDS TO BE CALLED
SECRET

SECRET

PAGE 02 NATO 06816 141704Z

INTO QUESTION. ANOTHER QUESTION, WHICH DOES NOT HAVE TO BE ANSWERED NOW, IS WHETHER THE WEST SHOULD PRESENT AGGREGATE TOTALS ON EASTERN GROUND AND AIR DATA IN CASE THE PRESENT WESTERN APPROACH FAILS. THIS QUESTION CAN ONLY BE ANSWERED IN LIGHT OF THE DATA DISCUSSION WITH THE EAST.

2. US REP (MOORE) SAID HE WOULD, OF COURSE, FULLY REPORT

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

THE SPECIFIC APPROACH SUGGESTED BY FRG REP. HE STATED THAT WITH RESPECT TO THE ITALIAN COMMENTS AT THE PREVIOUS MEETING, THE US CONTINUED TO CONSIDER EXAMINATION OF THE RED DATA QUESTION TO BE PREMATURE. HE RECALLED THE US VIEW THAT IT IS IMPORTANT FOR THE FORESEEABLE FUTURE TO FORCE THE EAST TO EXPLAIN THE FIGURES IT HAS TABLED, AND NOT TO ENABLE THE EAST TO INSTEAD QUESTION WESTERN ESTIMATES OF EASTERN DATA.

3. ITALIAN REP (SFARA) SUPPORTED THE FRG PROPOSAL TO AUTHORIZE THE AHG TO TABLE SELECTED WESTERN ESTIMATES OF EASTERN DATA.

4. CANADIAN REP (BARTLEMAN) SAW TWO ASPECTS TO THE FRG PROPOSAL. ON THE ONE HAND, HE THOUGHT IT WOULD BE USEFUL TO SEND THE AHG "RED DATA" BROKEN DOWN ACCORDING TO THE FORMAT OF WESTERN DATA, FOR BACKGROUND USE. ON THE OTHER HAND, HE HAD RESERVATIONS ABOUT AUTHORIZING THE AHG TO INTRODUCE ANY OF THIS DATA INTO THE NEGOTIATION. MUCH WOULD HAVE TO BE DONE BEFORE WE REACH THE POINT OF AUTHORIZING THE AHG TO USE THIS DATA WITH THE EAST.

5. MC REP (GROUP CAPTAIN SMITH) QUESTIONED THE NEED TO SEND THE AHG SUCH A BREAKDOWN OF RED DATA FOR BACKGROUND PURPOSES. HE NOTED THAT MCM-86-76 GIVES THE AHG THE MATERIAL THEY NEED TO SATISFY THEMSELVES. HE NOTED THAT MCM-86-76 REFLECTS

SECRET

SECRET

OUR ESTIMATES BASED ON EASTERN TO&E. A HIGHLIGHTED TABLE AS PROPOSED BY THE FRG WOULD HAVE TO BE BASED ON ASSUMPTIONS THAT THE EAST ALLOCATES MEN BETWEEN SUPPORT ELEMENTS IN MAJOR FORMATIONS AND DIVISIONS, IN A CERTAIN, SPECIFIED MANNER. THE EAST MIGHT NOT NECESSARILY TAKE THE SAME APPROACH WHEN THEY PRESENT THEIR DISAGGREGATED DATA. THUS THE AHG COULD HAVE PROBLEMS IN INTERPRETING SUCH A HIGHLIGHTED TABLE. ON THE QUESTION OF WHETHER THE AHG SHOULD BE AUTHORIZED TO USE ANY OF THIS DATA WITH THE EAST, THIS WAS A POLITICAL QUESTION ON WHICH HE COULD NOT COMMENT.

6. COMMENT: HITHERTO, PROPOSALS TO AUTHORIZE THE AHG TO USE RED DATA HAVE ONLY APPLIED TO THE AGGREGATE GROUND, AND GROUND PLUS AIR TOTALS. THE FRG PROPOSAL REPRESENTS THE FIRST TIME ANYONE HAS PROPOSED TABLING MORE DETAILED RED DATA, ON A SELECTIVE BASIS. THE FRG PROPOSAL WOULD ENCOUNTER THE SAME DIFFICULTIES THE US HAS PREVIOUSLY STATED REGARDING THE USE OF AGGREGATE RED DATA, INCLUDING THE CONFRONTATIONAL NATURE OF TABLING SUCH DATA. IN ADDITION, THE USE OF DETAILED RED DATA WOULD RAISE THE QUESTION BOTH OF DIFFERING ALLIED ESTIMATES OF PARTICULAR NUMBERS, AS WELL AS A DANGER OF REVEALING SENSITIVE INTELLIGENCE

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

SOURCES IN ARRIVING AT PARTICULAR NUMBERS. THE IDEA OF SENDING THE AHG SUCH DATA FOR BACKGROUND PURPOSES ONLY MIGHT SERVE AS A COMPROMISE, BUT IT IS QUESTIONABLE WHETHER THIS WOULD BE ANY MORE USEFUL TO THE AHG THAN MCM-86-76, WHICH IS THE DESIGNATED PRIMARY SOURCE ON EASTERN DATA.

7. ACTION REQUESTED: AN INSTRUCTED VIEW ON THE FRG PROPOSAL, IF POSSIBLE BY MONDAY, JULY 18 FOR USE ON A BILATERAL BASIS WITH FRG DELEGATION. BENNETT

SECRET

NNN

Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: n/a
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 14-Jul-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977NATO06816
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: RR
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: n/a
Format: TEL
From: NATO
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770755/aaaabvoo.tel
Line Count: 124
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE
Message ID: 3e67566b-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ACTION ACDA
Original Classification: SECRET
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 3
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: SECRET
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 NATO 6689 (DTG 112139Z JUL 77)
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 28-Oct-2004 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 1854914
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: MBFR: RED DATA: SPC MEETING JULY 14
TAGS: PARM, NATO
To: SECSTATE WASHDC WASHDC MULTIPLE
Type: TE
vdkvgwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/3e67566b-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009